

# CTC EVALUATION REVIEW PERIOD: FY 16-17 LIBERTY COUNTY

CTC BEING REVIEWED: LIBERTY CO. BOARD OF COMMISSIONERS

D.B.A. LIBERTY TRANSIT

ADDRESS: Post Office Box 730, Bristol, Florida 32321

CONTACT: ANN KINCAID & MONICA WELLES PHONE: 850-643-2524

\* \* \*

REVIEW DATE: JANUARY 23, 2018

PERSON CONDUCTING THE REVIEW: KWENTIN EASTBERG, ARPC

**CONTACT INFORMATION:** 850-488-6211 x105

#### **EVALUATION INFORMATION**

Page	An LCB review will consist of, but is not limited to the following pages:			
1	Cover Page			
2	Entrance Interview Questions			
3	Chapter 427.0155 (3) Review the CTC monitoring of contracted operators			
	Chapter 427.0155 (4) Review TDSP to determine utilization of school buses and public			
	transportation services			
4	Rule 41-2.006(1) Minimum Insurance Compliance			
	Rule 41-2.011 (2) Evaluation of cost-effectiveness of Coordination Contractors and			
	Transportation Alternatives			
5	Commission Standards and Local Standards			
7	On-Site Observation			
8	Surveys – Rider/Beneficiary, Contractors, Purchasing Agencies			
11	Level of Cost - Worksheet 1			
12	Level of Competition – Worksheet 2			
13	Level of Coordination – Worksheet 3			
14	Status Report Follow-Up From Last Review			
15	Findings and Recommendations			

#### **Notes to remember:**

- The CTC should not conduct the evaluation or surveys. If the CTC is also the PA, the PA should contract with an outside source to assist the LCB during the review process.
- Attach a copy of the CTD NET Safety Compliance & Emergency Management Self Certification (replaces the CTD Annual QA Self Certification).

#### **ENTRANCE INTERVIEW QUESTIONS**

#### INTRODUCTION AND BRIEFING

Describe the evaluation process - LCB evaluates the CTC and forwards a copy of the evaluation to the CTD.

The LCB reviews the CTC once every year to evaluate the operations and the performance of the local coordinator.

The LCB will be reviewing the following areas:

- ✓ Chapter 427, Rules 41-2 and 14-90, CTD Standards, and Local Standards
- ✓ Following up on the Status Report from last year and calls received from the Ombudsman program.
- ✓ Monitoring of contractors.
- ✓ Surveying riders/beneficiaries, purchasers of service, and contractors

The LCB will issue a Review Report with the findings and recommendations to the CTC no later than 30 working days after the review has concluded.

Once the CTC has received the Review Report, the CTC will submit a Status Report to the LCB within 30 working days.

#### USING THE APR, COMPILE THIS INFORMATION

Operating Environment	Rural
Organization Type	Public Entity/Government
Network Type	Sole Provider
Name the operators that your company has contract with	None
Name the groups that your company has coordination contracts	None
with	

# NAME THE ORGANIZATIONS AND AGENCIES THAT PURCHASE SERVICE FROM THE CTC AND THE PERCENTAGE OF TRIPS EACH REPRESENTS? RECENT APR INFORMATION MAY BE USED.

Name of Agency	% of Trips	Name of Contact	Telephone Number
CTD – TDTF	20%	Cecile Del Moral	410-5702
Medicaid - Brokers	35%	Access2Care/Jason	720-450-3271
		Britten	
		Logisticare/Kellie	305-753-9280
		White	
		Medical	772-266-4971
		Transportation	
		Management,	
		Inc./Lisa	
		Sanders/Kizzie	
		Benjamin	
Liberty County Senior Citizens	7%	Ann Kincaid	643-5690
Local Government/Other	38%	Kathy Brown,	643-2215
		Clerk of Court	

#### **REVIEW AND DISCUSS TD HELPLINE CALLS:**

	Number of calls	Closed Cases	<b>Unsolved Cases</b>	
TD	0	0	0	

Review Date: 1/23/18 2 Liberty County

# COMPLIANCE WITH CHAPTER 427, F.S.

Review the CTC monitoring of its transportation operator contracts to ensure compliance with 427.0155(3), F.S. "Review all transportation operator contracts annually."

WHAT TYPE OF MONITORING DOES THE CTC PERFORM ON ITS OPERATOR(S) AND HOW OFTEN IS IT CONDUCTED?  Is a written report issued to the operator?  If NO, how are the contractors notified of the results of the monitoring?	Not applicable
WHAT TYPE OF MONITORING DOES THE CTC PERFORM ON ITS COORDINATION CONTRACTORS AND HOW OFTEN IS IT CONDUCTED? Is a written report issued? If NO, how are the contractors notified of the results of the monitoring?	Not applicable
WHAT ACTION IS TAKEN IF A CONTRACTOR RECEIVES AN UNFAVORABLE REPORT? IS THE CTC IN COMPLIANCE WITH THIS	Not applicable Yes
SECTION?  ASK TO SEE DOCUMENTATION OF MONITORING REPORTS.	Not applicable

Review the TDSP to determine the utilization of school buses and public transportation services [Chapter 427.0155(4)] "Approve and coordinate the utilization of school bus and public transportation services in accordance with the TDSP."

HOW IS THE CTC USING SCHOOL BUSES IN	Not applicable
THE COORDINATED SYSTEM?	

Rule 41-2.012(5)(b): "As part of the Coordinator's performance, the local Coordinating Board shall also set an annual percentage goal increase for the number of trips provided within the system for ridership on public transit, where applicable. In areas where the public transit is not being utilized, the local Coordinating Board shall set an annual percentage of the number of trips to be provided on public transit."

HOW IS THE CTC USING PUBLIC	Not applicable
TRANSPORTATION SERVICES IN THE	
COORDINATED SYSTEM?	
IS THERE A GOAL FOR TRANSFERRING	Not applicable
PASSENGERS FROM PARATRANSIT TO	
TRANSIT?	
If yes, what is the goal??	
Is the CTC accomplishing the goal?	
IS THE CTC IN COMPLIANCE WITH THIS	Yes
REQUIREMENT?	

Review Date: 1/23/18 3 Liberty County

### COMPLIANCE WITH 41-2, F.A.C.

#### Compliance with 41-2.006(1), Minimum Insurance Compliance

"...ensure compliance with the minimum liability insurance requirement of \$100,000 per person and \$200,000 per incident..."

WHAT ARE THE MINIMUM LIABILITY	\$200,000/ person
INSURANCE REQUIREMENTS?	\$300,000/occurrence
WHAT ARE THE MINIMUM LIABILITY	Not applicable
INSURANCE REQUIREMENTS IN THE	^^
OPERATOR AND COORDINATION	
CONTRACTS?	
HOW MUCH DOES THE INSURANCE COST	\$34,427/19-21 vehicles.
(per operator)?	Difficult to report exact amount. BOCC liability and
	vehicle coverage are reported/charged collectively.
DOES THE MINIMUM LIABILITY	No
INSURANCE REQUIREMENTS EXCEED \$1	
MILLION PER INCIDENT?	
If yes, was this approved by the Commission?	
IS THE CTC IN COMPLIANCE WITH THIS	Yes
SECTION?	

Compliance with 41-2.011(2), Evaluating Cost-Effectiveness of Coordination Contractors and Transportation Alternatives. "...contracts shall be reviewed annually by the Community Transportation Coordinator and the Coordinating Board as to the effectiveness and efficiency of the Transportation Operator or the renewal of any Coordination Contracts."

#### IF THE CTC HAS COORDINATION CONTRACTORS, DETERMINE THE COST-EFFECTIVENESS OF THESE CONTRACTORS. Not applicable

**Cost [CTC and Coordination Contractor (CC)]** 

	CTC	CC #1	CC #2	CC #3	CC #4
Flat contract rate (s) (\$ amount / unit)					
Detail other rates as needed: (e.g.					
ambulatory, wheelchair, stretcher, out-					
of-county, group)					
Special or unique considerations that influence costs?					
Explanation:					

#### **DO YOU HAVE TRANSPORTATION ALTERNATIVES?** No

(Those specific transportation services approved by rule or the Commission as a service not normally arranged by the Community Transportation Coordinator, but provided by the purchasing agency. Example: a neighbor providing the trip)

**Cost** [CTC and Transportation Alternative (Alt.)]

_	CTC	Alt. #1	Alt. #2	Alt. #3	Alt. #4
Flat contract rate (s) (\$ amount / unit)					
Detail other rates as needed: (e.g.					
ambulatory, wheelchair, stretcher, out-					
of-county, group)					
Special or unique considerations that influence costs?					
Explanation:					

#### **IS THE CTC IN COMPLIANCE WITH THIS SECTION?** Yes

Review Date: 1/23/18 4 Liberty County

# COMPLIANCE WITH 41-2, F.A.C.

Compliance with Commission and Local Standards "...shall adhere to Commission approved standards..."

Review the TDSP for the Commission and Local standards.

Commission Standards	Comments
Local toll free phone number must be posted in all vehicles.	In Compliance There are no long distance areas within the County.
•	,
Vehicle Cleanliness	In Compliance
Passenger/Trip Database	In Compliance
	CTS. Tablets used in all vehicles.
Adequate seating	In Compliance
Driver Identification	In Compliance
	Badge.
Passenger Assistance	In Compliance
Smoking, Eating and Drinking	In Compliance
Two-way Communications	In Compliance
	radios, cellular telephones
Air Conditioning/Heating	In Compliance
Billing Requirements	Not Applicable
Local Standards	Comments
Transport of Escorts and dependent children policy	In Compliance
Use, Responsibility, and cost of child restraint devices	In Compliance
Out-of-Service Area trips	In Compliance 60% of total trips were outside of the service area
CPR/1st Aid	In Compliance 14 drivers – certified/recertified January 2017
Driver Criminal Background	In Compliance
Screening	14 drivers. Performs Level 2 screening – current
Rider Personal Property	In Compliance 4 pieces
Advance reservation requirements	In Compliance 72 hours in advance
Pick-up Window	Standard – 95%
Pick-up Window	

Review Date: 1/23/18 5 Liberty County

# MEASURABLE STANDARDS AND GOALS

Measurable Standards/Goals	Standard/Goal	Latest Figures	Is the CTC/Operator meeting the Standard?
Public Transit			Not Applicable
Ridership			
On-Time	95%	(12/13/17)	Yes
Performance		96.7%	
Passenger No-Shows	<1% requested trips	<b>AOR:</b> 32,877 trips +	Yes
		9 unmet trips =	
		32,886 requested	
		trips.	
		1% = 328	
		<b>AOR:</b> 96 NS	
Accidents	1:100,000 vm	AOR:	Yes
(Chargeable)		1:363,288 vm	
Roadcalls	CTC	AOR:	Yes
	>10,000 vm/rc	0:363,288 vm	
Average age of fleet:		Average fleet age:	
		6 years old	
Complaints	1:1,000 trips	AOR:	Yes
		1:32,877 trips	
Number filed:			
Call-Hold Time	90% w/i 3 min	No Hold	Yes
		<u> </u>	

Review Date: 1/23/18 6 Liberty County

# ON-SITE OBSERVATION OF THE SYSTEM

Ride a vehicle within the coordinated system. Request a copy of the Manifest page that contains this trip. Attach a copy of the Manifest.

Date of Observation	1/23/18
Please list any special guests that were present	
Location	Bristol
Number of Passengers picked up/dropped off	9 ambulatory, 1 w/walker used lift
Was the driver on time?	Yes
If no, how many minutes late/early?	
Did the driver provide any passenger assistance?	Yes
Was the driver wearing any identification?	Yes – badge
Did the driver render an appropriate greeting?	Yes
Driver regularly transports the rider, not necessary.	
If CTC has a policy on seat belts, did the driver	Yes
ensure the passengers were properly belted?	
Was the vehicle neat and clean, and free from dirt,	Yes
torn upholstery, damaged or broken seats,	
protruding metal or other objects?	
Is there a sign posted on the interior of the vehicle	Yes
with both a local phone number and the TD	
Helpline for comments/complaints/commendations?	
Does the vehicle have working heat and air	Yes
conditioning?	
Does the vehicle have two-way communications in	Yes – radio. tablet.
good working order?	
Was there safe and appropriate seating for all	Yes
passengers?	
If used, was the lift in good working order?	Yes
Did the driver properly use the lift and secure the	Yes
passenger? If no, please explain:	

#### 12/13/17 Trips

Funding Source	No. of Round Trips	No. of Riders/Beneficiarie	No. of Calls to Make	No. of Calls Made
CTD				
Medicaid				
Other: OAA				
Other				
Totals				

Number of Round Trips	Number of Riders/Beneficiaries to Survey
0 - 200	30%
201 - 1200	10%
1201 +	5%

Review Date: 1/23/18 7 Liberty County

# RIDER/BENEFICIARY SURVEY **SUMMARY**

**Selected Date of Service:** 12/13/17

**Staff making call:** Kwentin Eastberg **Date of Call:** 2/5/18 Funding Source: Various

1. Did you receive transportation service on the	Yes – 6
selected date?	No - 0
2. Where you charged an amount in addition to	Yes - 0
the co-payment? If so, how much?	No - 6
3. How often do you normally obtain	Daily – 5, Weekly -2, Every other Month – 1,
transportation?	2-3 Times/Week - 1
4. Have you ever been denied transportation	No - 5
services? If no, skip to question #5.	Yes - 0
a. How many times in the last 6 months have you	
been refused transportation services?	Have been deferred or unable to accommodate
b. What was the reason given for refusing you	preferred times
transportation services?	
5. For what reasons do you normally use the	Medical - 9, Education/Training/Day Care – 0,
service?	Nutritional – 0, Life-Sustaining/Other – 1
6. Did you have a problem with your trip on the	No - 5
selected date? If yes, please state/choose the	Yes- 0
problem.	
7. On a scale of 1 to 5, with 5 being most	Phone Survey: 9.3/10
satisfied, rate the transportation you have been	Written Survey: 4.8
receiving.	
8. What does transportation mean to you?	-
Do we have permission to use your comments	
in publications?	

Sample Size: 4 returned surveys	Very Good	Good	Neutral	Poor	Very Poor	Avg Score
<b>Dependability</b> - Able to schedule a trip for the time period I need.	5	4	3	2	1	4.8
Service runs the times when I need it.	5	4	3	2	1	4.8
Easy to arrange trips.	5	4	3	2	1	4.8
It is convenient to change scheduled trips	5	4	3	2	1	
when necessary.						4.0
Comfort/Cleanliness - The vehicles	5	4	3	2	1	
are clean and well maintained.						4.3
The driver provides a safe and	5	4	3	2	1	
comfortable ride.						5.0
Waiting Time - The vehicle picks me	5	4	3	2	1	
up within 30 minutes of my scheduled						
time.						4.8
I arrived at my destination at the	5	4	3	2	1	
scheduled time.						4.8
Cost - Amount I pay for my trip is	5	4	3	2	1	
reasonable.						5.0
The reservationist is pleasant.	5	4	3	2	1	4.8
The drivers are courteous and helpful.	5	4	3	2	1	4.8
Overall Courtesy of Employees	5	4	3	2	1	4.8
Overall Satisfaction of Service	5	4	3	2	1	4.8

Review Date: 1/23/18 8 **Liberty County** 

#### **Comments:**

- The service provided to me if very very good.
- Good and needed service
- Really Satisfied
- Monica Really helps out
- Really good drivers
- Grateful for service
- Driver speeding, says they aren't allowed to help push wheelchairs.

Review Date: 1/23/18 9 Liberty County

# **CONTRACTOR SURVEY SUMMARY**

# **Contractor's Name (optional):**

# NO CONTRACTORS TO CONTACT

1. Do the riders/beneficiaries call your facility	
directly to cancel a trip?	
2. Do the riders/beneficiaries call your facility	
directly to issue a complaint?	
3. Do you have a toll-free phone number for a	
rider/beneficiary to issue commendations	
and/or complaints posted on the interior of all	
vehicles that are used to transport TD riders?	
If yes, is the phone number posted the	
CTC's?	
4. Are the invoices you send to the CTC paid in	
a timely manner?	
5. Does the CTC give your facility adequate time	
to report statistics?	
6. Have you experienced any problems with the	
CTC? If yes, what type of problems?	
Comments	

# PURCHASING AGENCY SURVEY SUMMARY

Staff making call: Kwentin Eastberg

Date: 2/3/17

1. Do you purchase transportation from the coordinated system? If no, why?	Yes -1
2. Which transportation operator provides services to your clients?	Liberty Transit - 1
3. What is the primary purpose of purchasing transportation for your clients?	Medical - 1
4. On average, how often do your clients use the transportation system?	5 Times/Week - 1
5. Have you had any unresolved problems with the coordinated transportation system? If no, skip to question 7.	No - 1
6. What type of problems have you had with the coordinated system?	None -1
7. Overall, are you satisfied with the transportation you have purchased for your clients? If no, why?	Yes - 1

#### **Comments:**

# **Responding to Survey:**

Access2Care

### **Other Purchasers:**

Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged Liberty County Senior Citizens Logisticare Medical Transportation Management, Inc.

Review Date: 1/23/18 11 Liberty County

# LEVEL OF COST WORKSHEET 1

Insert Cost page from the AOR.

Revenues	\$ 581,778
Expenditures	\$ 534,642
Difference	\$ 47,136

# NOTES.

Profit seems excessive. Discussed revisiting rate worksheets. When equipment revenues were subtracted, the profit is much less. Equipment is not shown as an expense in the AOR worksheets, but is depreciated over the years.

Review Date: 1/23/18 12 Liberty County

# **LEVEL OF COMPETITION**

# WORKSHEET 2

**Inventory of Transportation Operators in the Service Area** 

	Operators	Operators Contracted	Include Trips	% of all Trips
	Available	in the System.		
Private Non-Profit				
Private For-Profit				
Government	2 (school)	1	32,877	100
Public Transit Agency				
Total	2	1	32,877	100

How many of the operators are coordination	0
contractors?	
Of the operators included in the local coordinated	0
system, how many have the capability of expanding	
capacity?	
Does the CTC have the ability to expand?	Yes
Indicate the date the latest transportation operator	Not Applicable
was brought into the system.	
Does the CTC have a competitive procurement	Yes
process?	
In the past five (5) years, how many times have the	Not Applicable
following methods been used in selection of the	
transportation operators? Request for	
Qualifications, Request for Proposals, Requests for	
Interested Parties, Low Bid, Negotiation Only	
Which of the methods listed above were used to	Not Applicable
select the current operators?	

Which of the following items are incorporated in the review and selection of transportation operators for inclusion in the coordinated system?

$\checkmark$	Capabilities of operator	✓	Reporting Capabilities	✓	Insurance
	Age of company	✓	Financial Strength	<b>√</b>	Accident History
$\checkmark$	Previous experience		Performance Bond	✓	Quality
$\checkmark$	Management		Responsiveness to	<b>√</b>	Community Knowledge
			Solicitation		
$\checkmark$	Qualifications of staff		Scope of Work	✓	Cost of the Contracting
					Process
$\checkmark$	Resources	<b>√</b>	Safety Program	<b>√</b>	Price
	Economies of Scale	<b>√</b>	Capacity		Distribution of Costs
	Contract Monitoring	<b>√</b>	Training Program		Other: (list)

If a competitive bid or Request for Proposals has been used	Not Applicable
to select the transportation operators, to how many potential	
operators was the request distributed in the most recently	
completed process?	
How many responded?	Not Applicable
The request for bids/proposals was distributed:	Not Applicable
Has the CTC reviewed the possibilities of competitively	Yes - maintenance supplies, vehicle parts
contracting any services other than transportation provision	Uses State contract for office supplies, furniture,
(such as fuel, maintenance, etc)?	computers and vehicles

Review Date: 1/23/18 13 Liberty County

# LEVEL OF AVAILABILITY (COORDINATION) WORKSHEET 3

Planning— What are the coordinated plans for	There are no other operators. All transportation is
transporting the TD population?	provided by the CTC.
<b>Public Information</b> – How is public information	Newspaper, radio
distributed about transportation services in the	
community?	
<b>Certification</b> – How are individual certifications	Uniform eligibility form used by CTC staff
and registrations coordinated for local TD	
transportation services?	
Eligibility Records – What system is used to	Eligibility form completed by CTC staff
coordinate which individuals are eligible for	Riders are recertified annually based on the rider's
special transportation services in the community?	enrollment date.
Call Intake – To what extent is transportation	All calls are made to CTC. Multiple lines
coordinated to ensure that a user can reach a	1
Reservationist on the first call?	
<b>Reservations</b> – What is the reservation process?	All reservations are documented when rider calls
How is the duplication of a reservation prevented?	to make reservation. Staff verifies reservation the
list is the depresent of a rest value provened.	day prior to trip.
<b>Trip Allocation</b> – How is the allocation of trip	CTC provides 100% of all trips.
requests to providers coordinated?	or or provides room or an unps
Scheduling – How is the trip assignment to	CTC staff schedules and dispatches all vehicles
vehicles coordinated?	or o start standards and disputsion are temotor
<b>Transport</b> – How are the actual transportation	CTC staff coordinates all trips.
services and modes of transportation coordinated?	or o stair coordinates air arps.
<b>Dispatching</b> – How is the real time	CTC dispatches all drivers.
communication and direction of drivers	or outspacenes air arrivers.
coordinated?	
<b>General Service Monitoring</b> – How is the	NA
overseeing of transportation operators	
coordinated?	
Daily Service Monitoring – How are real-time	Complaints are dealt with by using the LCB
resolutions to trip problems coordinated?	complaint and grievance procedures. Dispatcher is
Francisco de la Proposición de	responsible for resolving most problems at the
	local level.
<b>Trip Reconciliation</b> – How is the confirmation of	CTC staff reconciles all driver manifests to billing
official trips coordinated?	records.
<b>Billing</b> – How is the process for requesting and	CTC staff lists on driver's manifest all required
processing fares, payments, and reimbursements	fees to be collected from riders.
coordinated?	
Reporting – How is operating information	CTC staff – dispatcher, finance officer, director
reported, compiled, and examined?	Data is compiled and verified by the Program
r, r,	Coordinator.
Cost Resources – How are costs shared between	NA
the coordinator and the operators (s) in order to	
reduce the overall costs of the coordinated	
program?	
<b>Information Resources</b> – How is information	Emails and letters when changes occur.
shared with other organizations to ensure smooth	Calls are made to riders affected by a change.
service provision and increased service provision?	
Overall – What type of formal agreement does	NA
the CTC have with organizations, which provide	
transportation in the community?	

Review Date: 1/23/18 14 Liberty County

# STATUS REPORT FOLLOW-UP FROM LAST REVIEW DATE OF REVIEW: 1/31/17

There were no findings or recommendations in the last review.

Review Date: 1/23/18 15 Liberty County

# LOCAL COORDINATING BOARD ANNUAL REVIEW COMMUNITY TRANSPORTATION COORDINATOR FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS REVIEW PERIOD: FY 16-17

CTC Being Reviewed Liberty County Board of Commissioners

d.b.a. Liberty Transit

**Review Date** 1/31/2017

#### **General Information**

Liberty County Board of Commissioners/Liberty Transit was designated as the CTC for Liberty County for Fiscal Years July 1, 2012 – June 30, 2017. The CTC is a public entity/government organization, operating as a sole provider in a rural area.

**Findings and Recommendations** 

Compliance with Chapter 427, F.S.	Area of Noncompliance: None
Compliance with Rule 41-2, F.A.C.	Area of Noncompliance: None
Commission Standards and Local Standards	Area of Noncompliance: None
On-Site Observation of the System	Area of Noncompliance: None
Rider/Beneficiary Survey Summary	Area of Noncompliance: None
Contractor Survey Summary	Area of Noncompliance: None
Purchasing Agency Survey Summary	Area of Noncompliance: None
Level of Cost – Worksheet 1	Area of Noncompliance: None
Level of Competition – Worksheet 2	Area of Noncompliance: None
Level of Coordination – Worksheet 3	Area of Noncompliance: None
Status Report Follow-Up From Last Review	Area of Noncompliance: None

Report completed by: Kwentin Eastberg, LCB/ARPC staff

Approved by the LCB on February 6, 2018

Review Date: 1/23/18 16 Liberty County