

CTC EVALUATION REVIEW PERIOD: FY 16-17 GULF COUNTY

CTC BEING REVIEWED: GULF COUNTY ARC & TRANSPORTATION

D.B.A. GULF COUNTY TRANSPORTATION

ADDRESS: Post Office Box 8, Port St. Joe, Florida 32456

CONTACT: ANDREW RUTHERFORD & DONNA WALDO

PHONE: 850-229-6550

* * *

REVIEW DATE: JANUARY 24, 2018

PERSON CONDUCTING THE REVIEW: KWENTIN EASTBERG, ARPC

CONTACT INFORMATION: 850-488-6211 x105

EVALUATION INFORMATION

Page	An LCB review will consist of, but is not limited to the following pages:
1	Cover Page
2	Entrance Interview Questions
3	Chapter 427.0155 (3) Review the CTC monitoring of contracted operators
	Chapter 427.0155 (4) Review TDSP to determine utilization of school buses and public
	transportation services
4	Rule 41-2.006(1) Minimum Insurance Compliance
	Rule 41-2.011 (2) Evaluation of cost-effectiveness of Coordination Contractors and Transportation
	Alternatives
5	Commission Standards and Local Standards
7	On-Site Observation
8	Surveys – Rider/Beneficiary, Contractors, Purchasing Agencies
11	Level of Cost - Worksheet 1
12	Level of Competition – Worksheet 2
13	Level of Coordination – Worksheet 3
14	Status Report Follow-Up From Last Review
15	Findings and Recommendations

Notes to remember:

- The CTC should not conduct the evaluation or surveys. If the CTC is also the PA, the PA should contract with an outside source to assist the LCB during the review process.
- Attach a copy of the CTD NET Safety Compliance & Emergency Management Self Certification (replaces the CTD Annual QA Self Certification).

ENTRANCE INTERVIEW QUESTIONS

INTRODUCTION AND BRIEFING

Describe the evaluation process - LCB evaluates the CTC and forwards a copy of the evaluation to the CTD.

The LCB reviews the CTC once every year to evaluate the operations and the performance of the local coordinator.

The LCB will be reviewing the following areas:

- ✓ Chapter 427, Rules 41-2 and 14-90, CTD Standards, and Local Standards
- ✓ Following up on the Status Report from last year and calls received from the Ombudsman program.
- ✓ Monitoring of contractors.
- ✓ Surveying riders/beneficiaries, purchasers of service, and contractors

The LCB will issue a Review Report with the findings and recommendations to the CTC no later than 30 working days after the review has concluded.

Once the CTC has received the Review Report, the CTC will submit a Status Report to the LCB within 30 working days.

USING THE APR, COMPILE THIS INFORMATION

Operating Environment	Rural
Organization Type	Private Non-Profit
Network Type	Sole Provider
Name the operators that your company has contract with	None
Name the groups that your company has coordination contracts with	None

NAME THE ORGANIZATIONS AND AGENCIES THAT PURCHASE SERVICE FROM THE CTC AND THE PERCENTAGE OF TRIPS EACH REPRESENTS? RECENT APR INFORMATION MAY BE USED.

Name of Agency	% of Trips	Name of Contact	Telephone Number
APD	29%	Charlene Thomas	872-7652
CTD – TDTF	38%	Cecile Del Moral	410-5702
Medicaid - Brokers	11%	Access2Care/Gini Miller	727-282-1671
		Logisticare/Kellie White Medical Transportation	305-753-9280
		Management, Inc./Lisa Sanders	772-266-4971
Gulf County Sr. Citizens Assn.	11%	Debbie Sommers	229-8466
Local Government – BOCC,	<1%	Don Butler,	229-6111
City of Wewahitchka,		Cindy,	639-2605
City of Port St. Joe		Charlotte	229-8261
Local Non-Government	11%		
Other Federal Programs	<1%		

REVIEW AND DISCUSS TD HELPLINE CALLS:

	Number of calls	Closed Cases	Unsolved Cases
TD	unavailable		

COMPLIANCE WITH CHAPTER 427, F.S.

Review the CTC monitoring of its transportation operator contracts to ensure compliance with 427.0155(3), F.S. "Review all transportation operator contracts annually."

WHAT TYPE OF MONITORING DOES THE CTC PERFORM ON ITS OPERATOR(S) AND HOW OFTEN IS IT CONDUCTED? Is a written report issued to the operator? If NO, how are the contractors notified of the results of the monitoring?	Not applicable
WHAT TYPE OF MONITORING DOES THE CTC PERFORM ON ITS COORDINATION CONTRACTORS AND HOW OFTEN IS IT CONDUCTED? Is a written report issued? If NO, how are the contractors notified of the results of the monitoring?	Not applicable
WHAT ACTION IS TAKEN IF A CONTRACTOR RECEIVES AN UNFAVORABLE REPORT?	Not applicable
IS THE CTC IN COMPLIANCE WITH THIS SECTION? ASK TO SEE DOCUMENTATION OF MONITORING REPORTS.	Yes Not applicable

Review the TDSP to determine the utilization of school buses and public transportation services [Chapter 427.0155(4)] "Approve and coordinate the utilization of school bus and public transportation services in accordance with the TDSP."

HOW IS THE CTC USING SCHOOL BUSES IN	Not applicable
THE COORDINATED SYSTEM?	

Rule 41-2.012(5)(b): "As part of the Coordinator's performance, the local Coordinating Board shall also set an annual percentage goal increase for the number of trips provided within the system for ridership on public transit, where applicable. In areas where the public transit is not being utilized, the local Coordinating Board shall set an annual percentage of the number of trips to be provided on public transit."

HOW IS THE CTC USING PUBLIC	Not applicable
TRANSPORTATION SERVICES IN THE	
COORDINATED SYSTEM?	
IS THERE A GOAL FOR TRANSFERRING	Not applicable
PASSENGERS FROM PARATRANSIT TO	
TRANSIT?	
If yes, what is the goal??	
Is the CTC accomplishing the goal?	
IS THE CTC IN COMPLIANCE WITH THIS	Yes
REQUIREMENT?	

COMPLIANCE WITH 41-2, F.A.C.

Compliance with 41-2.006(1), Minimum Insurance Compliance

"...ensure compliance with the minimum liability insurance requirement of \$100,000 per person and \$200,000 per incident..."

WHAT ARE THE MINIMUM LIABILITY INSURANCE REQUIREMENTS?	\$1,000,000 combined single limit
WHAT ARE THE MINIMUM LIABILITY INSURANCE REQUIREMENTS IN THE OPERATOR AND COORDINATION CONTRACTS?	Not applicable
HOW MUCH DOES THE INSURANCE COST (per operator)?	CTC - \$31,221/13 vehicles
DOES THE MINIMUM LIABILITY INSURANCE REQUIREMENTS EXCEED \$1 MILLION PER INCIDENT? If yes, was this approved by the Commission?	No
IS THE CTC IN COMPLIANCE WITH THIS SECTION?	Yes

Compliance with 41-2.011(2), Evaluating Cost-Effectiveness of Coordination Contractors and Transportation Alternatives. "...contracts shall be reviewed annually by the Community Transportation Coordinator and the Coordinating Board as to the effectiveness and efficiency of the Transportation Operator or the renewal of any Coordination Contracts."

IF THE CTC HAS COORDINATION CONTRACTORS, DETERMINE THE COST-EFFECTIVENESS OF THESE CONTRACTORS. Not applicable

Cost [CTC and Coordination Contractor (CC)]

	1			
of-county, group) Special or unique considerations that influence costs? Explanation:				
?)	?	?	

DO YOU HAVE TRANSPORTATION ALTERNATIVES? No

(Those specific transportation services approved by rule or the Commission as a service not normally arranged by the Community Transportation Coordinator, but provided by the purchasing agency. Example: a neighbor providing the trip)

Cost [CTC and Transportation Alternative (Alt.)]

cost [CTC and Transportation Internative (Int.)]					
	CTC	Alt. #1	Alt. #2	Alt. #3	Alt. #4
Flat contract rate (s) (\$ amount / unit)					
Detail other rates as needed: (e.g.					
ambulatory, wheelchair, stretcher, out-					
of-county, group)					
Special or unique considerations that influence costs?					
Explanation:					

IS THE CTC IN COMPLIANCE WITH THIS SECTION? Yes

Review Date 1/24/18 4 Gulf County

COMPLIANCE WITH 41-2, F.A.C.

Compliance with Commission and Local Standards "...shall adhere to Commission approved standards..."

Review the TDSP for the Commission and Local standards.

Commission Standards	Comments
Local toll free phone number must be posted in all vehicles.	In Compliance There are no long distance areas within the county.
Vehicle Cleanliness	In Compliance
Passenger/Trip Database	In Compliance CTS. Tablets used in all vehicles. Paperwork available in case the tablet connection goes down.
Adequate seating	In Compliance
Driver Identification	In Compliance Badge
Passenger Assistance	In Compliance
Smoking, Eating and Drinking	In Compliance
Two-way Communications	In Compliance cellular telephones. Tablets can also send messages to dispatch.
Air Conditioning/Heating	In Compliance
Billing Requirements	Not Applicable
Local Standards	Comments
Transport of Escorts and dependent children policy	In Compliance
Use, Responsibility, and cost of child restraint devices	In Compliance
Out-of-Service Area trips	In Compliance 19.8% of total trips were outside of the service area
CPR/1st Aid	In Compliance 10 drivers – (2 FT, 8 PT) every 2 years
Driver Criminal Background Screening	In Compliance 10 drivers (2 FT, 8PT). Performs Level 2 screening – every 5 years
Rider Personal Property	In Compliance Reasonable amount.
Advance reservation requirements	In Compliance 72 hours notice required, but accommodate when possible with lesser notice
Pick-up Window	Standard – 90% Survey Results – 98.5% In Compliance

MEASURABLE STANDARDS AND GOALS

Measurable Standards/Goals	Standard/Goal	Latest Figures	Is the CTC/Operator meeting the Standard?
Public Transit Ridership			Not Applicable
On-Time Performance	90%	(12/13/17) 98.5%	Yes
Passenger No-Shows	<1% requested trips	AOR: 22,306 trips + 63 = 22,369 requested trips. 1% = 223 AOR: 125 NS	Yes
Accidents (Chargeable)	1:100,000 vm	AOR: 0:292,187 vm	Yes
Roadcalls	CTC >10,000 vm/rc	AOR: 0:292,187 vm	Yes
Average age of fleet:		Average fleet age: 4.7 years old	
Complaints Number filed:	1:4,000 trips	AOR: 0:22,306 trips	Yes
Call-Hold Time	90% w/i 3 min		Yes

ON-SITE OBSERVATION OF THE SYSTEM

Ride a vehicle within the coordinated system. Request a copy of the Manifest page that contains this trip. Attach a copy of the Manifest.

	T
Date of Observation	1/24/18
Please list any special guests that were present	
Location	Port St Joe
Number of Passengers picked up/dropped off	1 ambulatory
Was the driver on time?	Yes
If no, how many minutes late/early?	
Did the driver provide any passenger assistance?	Yes
Was the driver wearing any identification?	Yes – badge
Did the driver render an appropriate greeting?	Yes
Driver regularly transports the rider, not necessary.	
If CTC has a policy on seat belts, did the driver	Yes
ensure the passengers were properly belted?	
Was the vehicle neat and clean, and free from dirt,	Yes
torn upholstery, damaged or broken seats,	
protruding metal or other objects?	
Is there a sign posted on the interior of the vehicle	NO- Corrected on Site, Vehicle #31
with both a local phone number and the TD	
Helpline for comments/complaints/commendations?	
Does the vehicle have working heat and air	Yes
conditioning?	
Does the vehicle have two-way communications in	Yes – cellular phone, tablet
good working order?	
Was there safe and appropriate seating for all	Yes
passengers?	
If used, was the lift in good working order?	Yes
Did the driver properly use the lift and secure the	Yes
passenger? If no, please explain:	
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	

6/1/15 Trips

Funding Source	No. of	No. of	No. of Calls to	No. of Calls
	Round Trips	Riders/Beneficiarie	Make	Made
CTD				
Medicaid				
Other: OAA				
Other: APD				
Local Government,				
Local Non-Governm				
Other				
Totals				

Number of Round Trips	Number of Riders/Beneficiaries to Survey
0 - 200	30%
201 - 1200	10%
1201 +	5%

RIDER/BENEFICIARY SURVEY SUMMARY

Staff making call: Kwentin Eastberg **Selected Date of Service:** 12/13/17

Date of Call: 2/6/18 **Funding Source:** Various

1. Did you receive transportation service on the	Yes - 2
selected date?	No - 0
2. Where you charged an amount in addition to	Yes - 0
the co-payment? If so, how much?	No - 2 (only co-pay when required)
3. How often do you normally obtain	1-2 Times/Week – 0
transportation?	3-5 Times/Week – 1
	Less than 1 Time/Month-0
	1-2 Times/Month – 1
	3-5 Times/Month-0
4. Have you ever been denied transportation	Yes - 0
services? If no, skip to question #5.	No - 2
a. How many times in the last 6 months have you	
been refused transportation services?	
b. What was the reason given for refusing you	
transportation services?	
5. For what reasons do you normally use the	Medical -2, Education/Training/Day Care – 0,
service?	Nutritional –1, Life-Sustaining/Other - 0
6. Did you have a problem with your trip on the	Yes- 0
selected date? If yes, please state/choose the	No - 2
problem.	
7. On a scale of 1 to 10, with 10 being most	Average Rating – 8 (2 responses)
satisfied, rate the transportation you have been	
receiving.	
8. What does transportation mean to you?	
Do we have permission to use your comments	
in publications?	

COMMENTS:

- Sometimes I forget to make and appoint and staff helps me out and works with me to set a new appointment.
- Sometimes my trip requests didn't make it in the system, hasn't happened for a while though.
- 72 hours advance notice is sometimes hard to give when the doctor says I have to come back in 2 days.

CONTRACTOR SURVEY SUMMARY

Contractor's Name (optional):

NO CONTRACTORS TO CONTACT

1. Do the riders/beneficiaries call your facility	
directly to cancel a trip?	
2. Do the riders/beneficiaries call your facility	
directly to issue a complaint?	
3. Do you have a toll-free phone number for a	
rider/beneficiary to issue commendations	
and/or complaints posted on the interior of all	
vehicles that are used to transport TD riders?	
If yes, is the phone number posted the	
CTC's?	
4. Are the invoices you send to the CTC paid in	
a timely manner?	
5. Does the CTC give your facility adequate time	
to report statistics?	
6. Have you experienced any problems with the	
CTC? If yes, what type of problems?	
Comments	

PURCHASING AGENCY SURVEY SUMMARY

Staff making call: Kwentin Eastberg

Date: 2/3/17

1. Do you purchase transportation from the coordinated system? If no, why?	Yes – 2
2. Which transportation operator provides services to your clients?	Gulf County Transportation - 2
3. What is the primary purpose of purchasing transportation for your clients?	Education/Training/Day Care – 0, Nutrition - 0, Shopping – 0, Medical – 1, Unknown - 1
4. On average, how often do your clients use the transportation system?	1 Time/week - 0 3 Times/week - 0 5 Times/week - 1 Unknown - 1
5. Have you had any unresolved problems with the coordinated transportation system? If no, skip to question 7.	No – 2
6. What type of problems have you had with the coordinated system?	None – 2
7. Overall, are you satisfied with the transportation you have purchased for your clients? If no, why?	Yes – 2

Responding to Survey:

Access2Care/Gini Miller City of Wewahitchka

Other Purchasers:

Commission for the Transportation Disadvantaged

Gulf County Senior Citizens

APD

City of Port St. Joe

Gulf County Board of County Commission

Bay St. Joseph Care and Rehabilitation (only arranges trips)

Beacon Villa Retirement Center (only arranges trips)

Logisticare/Kellie White

Medical Transportation Management, Inc./Lisa Sanders

COMMENTS:

Calls ahead to make sure all arrangement have been made.

LEVEL OF COST WORKSHEET 1

Insert Cost page from the AOR.

Revenues	\$ 664,954
Expenditures	\$ 623,208
Difference	\$ 41,746

Notes.

Profit seems excessive. When equipment revenues were subtracted, the profit is much less. Equipment is not shown as an expense in the AOR worksheets, but is depreciated over the years.

LEVEL OF COMPETITION WORKSHEET 2

Inventory of Transportation Operators in the Service Area

	701 til 010 1 0 p 01 til 0110 2 111 til 0 2 1 1 1 0 1 1 1 1 1 til 0 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1			
	Operators	Operators Contracted	Include Trips	% of all Trips
	Available	in the System.		
Private Non-Profit	1	1	22,306	100
Private For-Profit				
Government	1 (School)			
Public Transit Agency				
Total	2	1	22,306	100

How many of the operators are coordination contractors?	0
Of the operators included in the local coordinated	0
system, how many have the capability of expanding capacity?	
Does the CTC have the ability to expand?	Yes
Indicate the date the latest transportation operator was brought into the system.	Not Applicable
Does the CTC have a competitive procurement process?	Yes
In the past five (5) years, how many times have the following methods been used in selection of the transportation operators? Request for	Not Applicable
Qualifications, Request for Proposals, Requests for Interested Parties, Low Bid, Negotiation Only	
Which of the methods listed above were used to select the current operators?	Not Applicable

Which of the following items are incorporated in the review and selection of transportation operators for inclusion in the coordinated system?

\checkmark	Capabilities of operator	√	Reporting Capabilities	√	Insurance
\checkmark	Age of company	✓	Financial Strength	√	Accident History
\checkmark	Previous experience		Performance Bond	√	Quality
✓	Management	\checkmark	Responsiveness to	✓	Community Knowledge
			Solicitation		
\checkmark	Qualifications of staff	✓	Scope of Work	✓	Cost of the Contracting
					Process
✓	Resources	✓	Safety Program	✓	Price
√	Economies of Scale	V	Capacity	√	Distribution of Costs
√	Contract Monitoring	√	Training Program		Other: (list)

If a competitive bid or Request for Proposals has been used	Not Applicable
to select the transportation operators, to how many potential	
operators was the request distributed in the most recently	
completed process?	
How many responded?	Not Applicable
The request for bids/proposals was distributed:	Not Applicable
Has the CTC reviewed the possibilities of competitively	Yes - Fuel, maintenance supplies, office supplies,
contracting any services other than transportation provision	furniture, computers
(such as fuel, maintenance, etc)?	Uses State contract for vehicles.

LEVEL OF AVAILABILITY (COORDINATION) WORKSHEET 3

, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	1
Planning – What are the coordinated plans for transporting the TD population?	There are no other operators. All transportation is provided by the CTC.
Public Information – How is public information	Newspaper, radio, flyers
distributed about transportation services in the	
community?	** 10 11 11 11 0 11 0 mg 00
Certification – How are individual certifications	Uniform eligibility form used by CTC staff
and registrations coordinated for local TD	
transportation services?	
Eligibility Records – What system is used to	Eligibility form completed by CTC staff
coordinate which individuals are eligible for	Riders are recertified annually on the rider's
special transportation services in the community?	enrollment date.
Call Intake – To what extent is transportation	Multiple lines
coordinated to ensure that a user can reach a	Withitiple filles
Reservationist on the first call?	
	A11 1 1 11 11
Reservations – What is the reservation process?	All reservations are documented when rider calls
How is the duplication of a reservation prevented?	to make reservation. Staff verifies reservation the
	day prior to trip.
Trip Allocation – How is the allocation of trip	CTC provides 100% of all trips.
requests to providers coordinated?	
Scheduling – How is the trip assignment to	CTC staff schedules and dispatches all vehicles.
vehicles coordinated?	
Transport – How are the actual transportation	CTC staff coordinates all trips.
services and modes of transportation coordinated?	r i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i
Dispatching – How is the real time	CTC dispatches all drivers.
communication and direction of drivers	ere disputenes un dirvers.
coordinated?	
	NA
General Service Monitoring – How is the	INA
overseeing of transportation operators	
coordinated?	
Daily Service Monitoring – How are real-time	Complaints are dealt with by using the LCB
resolutions to trip problems coordinated?	complaint and grievance procedures.
	Reservationist or Transportation Director is
	responsible for resolving most problems at the
	local level.
Trip Reconciliation – How is the confirmation of official trips coordinated?	CTC staff reconciles all driver manifests to billing records.
Billing – How is the process for requesting and	CTC staff lists on driver's manifest all required fees to
processing fares, payments, and reimbursements coordinated?	be collected from riders.
Reporting – How is operating information reported,	CTC staff: dispatcher, finance officer, director
compiled, and examined?	Data is compiled and verified by the Transportation
compriou, and oxuminou.	Director.
Cost Resources – How are costs shared between the	NA
coordinator and the operators (s) in order to reduce the	
overall costs of the coordinated program?	
Information Resources – How is information shared	Email and letter when changes occur.
with other organizations to ensure smooth service	Calls are made to riders affected by a change.
provision and increased service provision?	and the control of th
Overall – What type of formal agreement does the	NA
CTC have with organizations, which provide	
transportation in the community?	

STATUS REPORT FOLLOW-UP FROM LAST REVIEW DATE OF REVIEW: 2/1/17

There were no findings or recommendations in the last review.

LOCAL COORDINATING BOARD ANNUAL REVIEW COMMUNITY TRANSPORTATION COORDINATOR FINDINGS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

REVIEW PERIOD: FY 16-17

Gulf County ARC & Transportation **CTC Being Reviewed**

d.b.a. Gulf County Transportation

Review Date 1/24/18

General Information

Gulf County ARC & Transportation/Gulf County Transportation was designated as the CTC for Gulf County for Fiscal Years July 1, 2012 – June 30, 2017. The CTC is a private non-profit organization, operating as a sole provider in a rural area.

Findings and Recommendations

Area of Noncompliance: None
Area of Noncompliance: None
Area of Noncompliance: None
Area of Noncompliance: TD Helpline Phone
Number not posted on interior of vehicle.
Corrected on Site
Area of Noncompliance: None
Suggestion: Review comments and make
adjustments as appropriate to the
reservation/provision/cost of services if applicable.
Area of Noncompliance: None

Report completed by: Kwentin Eastberg, LCB/ARPC staff

Approved by the LCB on February 7, 2018